BOARD MEETING

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

INTEGRATED WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD

JOE SERNA, JR., CALEPA BUILDING

1001 I STREET

2ND FLOOR

BYRON SHER AUDITORIUM

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 17, 2007

10:12 A.M.

TIFFANY C. KRAFT, CSR, RPR CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER LICENSE NUMBER 12277

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

ii

APPEARANCES

BOARD MEMBERS

- Ms. Margo Reid Brown, Chair
- Mr. Wesley Chesbro
- Mr. Jeffrey Danzinger
- Ms. Rosalie Mul
- Mr. Gary Petersen

STAFF

- Mr. Mark Leary, Executive Director
- Ms. Julie Nauman, Deputy Executive Officer
- Mr. Elliot Block, Staff Counsel
- Ms. Judy Friedman, Branch Manager, Organics & Resource Efficiency
- Ms. Kristen Garner, Executive Assistant
- Mr. Jim Lee, Deputy Director, Special Waste Division
- Mr. John Smith, Branch Manager, Recycling Business Assistance
- Ms. Brenda Smyth, Staff

ALSO PRESENT

- Mr. Terry Leveille, TL & Associates
- Mr. Mark Murray, Californians Against Waste
- Mr. Michael Paparian, former Board member
- Mr. Chuck White, Waste Management

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

iii

INDEX

		Page
I.	CALL TO ORDER	1
II.	ROLL CALL AND DECLARATION OF QUORUM	1
III.	OPENING REMARKS	1
IV.	REPORTS AND PRESENTATIONS	2
V.	PUBLIC COMMENT	35
VI.	CONSENT AGENDA	
VII.	CONTINUED BUSINESS AGENDA ITEMS	
VIII	. NEW BUSINESS AGENDA ITEMS	
	Permitting and Compliance	
1.	Consideration Of The Renewal And Issuance Of A Major Waste Tire Facility Permit For California Asbestos Monofill, Inc., Calaveras County (Committee Item B)	38
	Motion Vote	39 39
2.	Consideration Of The Completion Of Compliance Order IWMA BR99-92 For The City Of Baldwin Park, Los Angeles County (Committee Item C) Motion Vote	38
		39 39
3.	Consideration Of The Completion Of Compliance Order IWMA BR99-43 For The City Of Compton, Los	38
	Angeles County (Committee Item D) Motion Vote	
4.	Consideration Of The Completion Of Compliance Order IWMA BR03-02 For The City Of Gardena, Los Angeles County (Committee Item E) Motion Vote	38
		39 39
	Strategic Policy Development	

iv

INDEX CONTINUED

	Pa	age
5.	Consideration Of The 2007 Annual Rulemaking Calendar (Committee Item A) Motion Vote	38
		39 39
6.	Consideration Of A Memorandum Of Understanding Between Heal The Bay And The California Integrated Waste Management Board And Cal/EPA - - (Committee Item B)	38
	Motion Vote	39 39
7.	Workshop On Board Governance Policies - Strategic Directives (Committee Item C)	
	Market Development and Sustainability	
8.	Consideration Of The Scoring Criteria, Eligibility Criteria, and Evaluation Process For A Joint Solicitation Of The Used Oil Nonprofit Grant Program (7th Cycle); And The Used Oil Research, Testing, And Demonstration Grant Program (5th Cycle) (Used Oil Recycling Fund, FY 2006/07) (Committee Item B)	38
	Motion Vote	39 39
9.	Consideration Of The Grant Awards For The Tire-Derived Product Grant Program (Tire Recycling Management Fund, FY 2006/07) (Committee Item C)	43
	Motion Vote	46 46
10.	Consideration Of Contractor For The Tire Retread Targeted Outreach Materials And Promotional Training Contract (Tire Recycling Management Fund, FY 2006/07) (Committee Item D)	46
	Motion Vote	47 47

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

INDEX CONTINUED

	Pa	age
11.	Consideration Of Grant Awards For The Targeted Rubberized Asphalt Concrete Incentive Grant Program (Tire Recycling Management Fund, FY 2006/07) (Committee Item E)	48
	Motion Vote	48 49
12.	Consideration Of Revision Of Applicant Eligibility And Evaluation Process For The Tire-Derived Product Business Assistance Program (Tire Recycling Management Fund, FY 2006/07) (Committee Item F)	52
	Motion Vote	54 54
13.	PULLED Discussion And Request For Direction Regarding Sector And Industry-Wide Activities Authorized Under The Consulting Contract For The Tire-Derived Product Business Assistance Program (Committee Item G)	
14.	Consideration Of The Recycling Market Development Revolving Loan Program Application For Grover Landscape Services, Inc. (Recycling Market Development Revolving Loan Subaccount FY 2006/07) (Committee Item H)	49
	Motion Vote	51 51
15.	Update On The Implementation Of The Electronic Waste Recycling Act Of 2003 (Committee Item I)	
16.	Update Of Environmentally Preferable Purchasing Task Force Activities And Accomplishments For 2006 (Committee Item J)	
17.	Update On The Green Procurement Toolbox Of The Board's Green Procurement Action Plan (Committee Item K)	
	Other	

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

vi INDEX CONTINUED Page 18. Consideration Of The Scope Of Work For The 55 Lifecycle Assessment Of Organics Diversion Alternatives And Economic Analysis Of Greenhouse Gas Reduction Options (Integrated Waste Management Account FY, 2006/07) -- (Full Board Only) IX. BOARD MEMBERS COMMENT х. ADJOURNMENT 86 XI. REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE 87 PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

1

1	PROCEEDINGS

- 2 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Good morning. We have a lot
- 3 of people standing in the back. There's so many seats.
- 4 Can you guys please come, sit. We won't make you sit for
- 5 more than five or ten minutes.
- 6 Good morning. I can't imagine why you're all
- 7 here. We'd like to remind people about your cell phones.
- 8 We're going to call this meeting to order and call the
- 9 roll. I'd like to remind you about your cell phones to
- 10 please turn your cell phones in the vibrate mode.
- 11 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 12 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- 13 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Not yet. That's next on the
- 14 agenda. Sorry.
- 15 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Here.
- 17 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- 18 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Here.
- 19 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Here.
- 21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 22 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Here.
- 23 And we'll stand right now and do our Pledge of
- 24 Allegiance.
- 25 (Thereupon the Pledge of Allegiance was

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

- 1 recited in unison.)
- 2 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you.
- 3 Do any Board members have any expartes to
- 4 report?
- 5 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Up to date.
- 6 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Up to date, Madam Chair.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Great.
- 8 Now it gives me great pleasure to welcome back
- 9 one of our previous Board members, founding member of the
- 10 Integrated Waste Management Board as it exists and my
- 11 pleasure to meet Senator Chesbro. So we'd like to at this
- 12 time, if there's any comments from Board members, and then
- 13 we'll go straight to a swearing in.
- 14 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Welcome. Looking forward to
- 15 working with you. I know we had the privilege to work
- 16 with you on some legislative issues, and I know you bring
- 17 a wealth of knowledge and experience to the Board. So I'm
- 18 looking forward to working with you, former Senator.
- 19 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Well, Wesley, I also want
- 20 to welcome you. Two old-time recyclers getting together,
- 21 this is a really grand thing. Anyway, welcome.
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Are you going to stand
- 23 for that? He called you old timer.
- 24 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: As long as he includes
- 25 himself.

3

Easy for you to say, by the way, kid. 1 2 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Wesley, I think you know how much I respect you and how much I look forward to 3 4 working with you. 5 I dug up something. This is from the discussion at the Board in '92 when the first market development 6 7 strategy for the Board was established. And you should know, I know since I came back, I think I've mentioned on 8 several occasions I think market development was one of 9 the areas that the Board did very well during the early 10 years of the 939 era. And I think to the staff's chagrin 11 I think that it atrophied for a few years the first part 12 of this decade. And I think we've ramped it up again this 13 14 year with a much stronger focus. But here are Senator Chesbro's comments. I'll 15 only read a brief passage from that. He was the one who 16 introduced this strategy and led the way on it back then. 17 "I don't think we can overemphasize the 18 19 importance of this program and the need to move very rapidly. California's recycling future 20 21 depends on the success of this endeavor. The effort is also important and challenging at 22 23 another level, and that is that it provides us

the opportunity to contribute significantly to

California's economic development needs and help

24

4

meet the recessionary problems that business and 1 local governments and the state government are 2 facing all over the state. Recycling market 3 4 development is a significant economic development 5 opportunity." 6 It's a very basic statement. I think it was a 7 very thoughtful statement. I think it's very prophetic. I think that the experience since then has demonstrated 8 all of this to be abundantly true. Recycling is a job creator. It bolsters our economy. And of course, it 10 works hand in hand with everything that we're going to try 11 to do from here on. So thank you for coming back. I look 12 forward to working with you. 13 14 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you. Now I think we will take the opportunity to swear in our new member. 15 We'll do it down by the flags, of course. Raise your 16 hand. For the record, his hand is on the California Code 17 18 Statutes. 19 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Nonsectarian here. (Thereupon Mr. Westley Chesbro was duly sworn 20 21 into office as member of the Waste Management Board.) 22 23 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: That's it. Congratulations.

CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you very much.

(Applause)

24

- 1 Actually, someone said I should probably read the entire
- 2 thing all the way through to see if you could remember it
- 3 all.
- 4 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: I've said it a few times.
- 5 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Anyway, thank you. We will
- 6 have a little celebration. But I think as you all know we
- 7 have some other celebrations and acknowledgements here.
- 8 So we are going to do a little bit of our business and
- 9 then continue with our celebration.
- 10 I do want to mention a couple of opening remarks
- 11 and congratulations to the staff on activities that have
- 12 really raised the awareness of what the Integrated Waste
- 13 Management Board does throughout the state. And without
- 14 every single activity of what the Board is doing, because
- 15 we do tremendous work on a daily basis, just to highlight
- 16 the great events that we've been doing throughout the
- 17 state on erecycle.org and raising public awareness and
- 18 started our public education partnership has gained
- 19 tremendous outreach to the community on education.
- 20 And probably the biggest event this past month
- 21 that really got the Board involved was helping the
- 22 Governor produce a zero waste inaugural. And our staff
- 23 worked tirelessly over the holidays in partnership with
- 24 Waste Management, Inc., who stepped up to the plate and
- 25 recycled every piece, everything that was produced during

- 1 the inaugural, from food to bowls that they didn't know
- 2 were going to arrive at the event. The Green Dream on the
- 3 Capitol steps: Food waste, cardboard, paper, bottles,
- 4 cans. They worked with the Convention Center. They
- 5 worked with the restaurants. And it really highlighted
- 6 what can be done. And our Board staff did a tremendous
- 7 job. So I just want to acknowledge that. And we got
- 8 great coverage for a zero waste inaugural.
- 9 And then one quick little announcement and
- 10 farewell. Today is Sue K.'s last Board meeting. And want
- 11 to take an opportunity to thank you very much for the
- 12 tireless and humorous humor that you've brought to being
- 13 the AA for our Board and producing the Board agendas on a
- 14 monthly basis. It's been invaluable to me coming to this
- 15 Board and jumping right in as Chair, the professionalism
- 16 with which you brought to this position and just your
- 17 accuracy and tireless efforts on a monthly basis. So you
- 18 certainly will be missed tremendously. And we will
- 19 welcome you back any time.
- 20 (Applause)
- 21 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: And now a little departure
- 22 from our usual order. I'd like to have Mark give his
- 23 report, because it's going to lead right into our next
- 24 celebration and wanted to make sure that we acknowledged
- 25 and looked back and made that part of our celebration. So

7

Mark. 1 2 (Thereupon an overhead presentation was 3 presented as follows.) 4 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: Thank you, Madam 5 Good morning, Madam Chair and members. Welcome, 6 Wesley. 7 It has become somewhat of a Board tradition at the first month of the new year to reflect on what we've 8 accomplished in the past year. And I'm happy to once 9 again provide that report. And it's particularly fitting 10 I think today in tribute to departing member Cheryl Peace. 11 She is much a part of many of these accomplishments, and 12 13 is welcome to Wes as he comes to appreciate that he has some big shoes to fill. And we're an active Board in 14 15 trying to accomplish good things. You don't start a reflection on 2006 of course 16 without hitting on our number one achievement really in 17 the history of the Board, and that is the fact we achieved 18 the 50 percent milestone. 2006 marked a milestone not 19 only for the Board, but for California as well as we 20 21 celebrated achieving 52 percent waste reduction of our

The Board marked this accomplishment of course with a

state using 2005 numbers. This accomplishment met the

attention to our work we do here at the Board everyday.

mandate of AB 939 and brought national and global

22

23

24

- 1 series of events around the state. And the news was well
- 2 received by stakeholders, environmental groups, and public
- 3 officials. Of course, congratulations to all of us, but
- 4 most importantly, to the citizens of the state of
- 5 California for making that 50 percent.
- --000--
- 7 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: That 50 percent
- 8 carried over to another task of 2006. As a member of the
- 9 Governor's Climate Action Team and in concert with AB 32,
- 10 the California Global Warming Solutions Act, the Board is
- 11 responsible for implementing specific greenhouse gas
- 12 reduction strategies and tracking and reporting to the
- 13 Governor and the Legislature as progress is made.
- 14 2006 saw a great deal of attention from the Board
- 15 on global warming and greenhouse gases. Our tasks are
- 16 several-fold, including implementing three strategies
- 17 including achieving the 50 percent mandate, capturing
- 18 methane in landfills, and achieving high recycling levels
- 19 and moving towards zero waste, which is the subject of an
- 20 agenda item later today.
- 21 Of significant note, and as I mentioned earlier,
- 22 we did meet the first target of achieving 50 percent,
- 23 which means we can now take credit for a reduction in
- 24 greenhouse gases of 3 million metric tons CO2 equivalence.
- 25 The remaining two strategies of course will continue to

- 1 receive great focus on our part.
- 2 --000--
- 3 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: In the area of tires,
- 4 as you'll remember, on August 7th, 1998, the illegally
- 5 stored tires at the Royster tire facility in Tracy,
- 6 California were ignited. More than seven million tires
- 7 were engulfed in the initial blaze. The fire burned for
- 8 two months, subsided, but continued to smolder for more
- 9 than two and a half years. With the expenditure of over
- 10 \$17 million and many years of intense effort by Board
- 11 staff, air emissions have been abated, site
- 12 characterization and remediation have been completed, and
- 13 all the health threats of one of the greatest
- 14 environmental disasters in the state in the last two
- 15 decades have been mitigated.
- On September 21st, 2006, the property was sold at
- 17 a public tax lien auction. And as a result of this sale,
- 18 the Board has completed its efforts and no longer manages
- 19 the property. The responsibilities have been transferred
- 20 to a new owner.
- 21 --000--
- 22 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: And speaking of tire
- 23 cleanups, good things continue to happen in the last
- 24 remaining tire piles in the state of California in Sonoma
- 25 County. With the completion of the Universal Portfolio

- 1 site and the four other sites remediated, over 90 percent
- 2 of the tires at the longest known waste tire piles in the
- 3 state have been removed and properly disposed of.
- 4 --000--
- 5 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: In the solid waste
- 6 area, substantial accomplishments addressing illegal
- 7 dumping and environmental justice were realized in 2006 by
- 8 forming the solid waste collaborative with U.S. EPA, the
- 9 Torres Martinez Tribal Government, and other local, state,
- 10 and federal agencies. The mission of this collaborative
- 11 is to develop and implement a multi-jurisdictional plan to
- 12 clean up and prevent illegal dumping on the Torres
- 13 Martinez reservation. The plan includes community
- 14 outreach, monitoring and compliance, dump cleanup, access
- 15 control, and infrastructure development.
- The Board's role has been to implement through
- 17 the Solid Waste Cleanup Program to clean up and establish
- 18 access controls at the largest and most egregious illegal
- 19 dump sites on the reservation. Three major sites have
- 20 been identified for Board cleanup assistance. The first
- 21 site was cleaned up in the topic of a press event
- 22 coordinated by U.S. EPA in October of this year.
- --000--
- 24 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: Other accomplishments
- 25 in the solid waste area: In January 2004, AB 1497 was

- 1 enacted. This law mandates several new solid waste
- 2 facility permitting requirements and authorized the Board
- 3 to adopt regulations to implement these requirements.
- 4 During 2005 and 2006, staff conducted an
- 5 extensive rulemaking process to solicit input from
- 6 stakeholders in the scoping and drafting of the proposed
- 7 regulation. The formal rulemaking process began in April
- 8 2006. The Board adopted the regs in October. The
- 9 regulations will be submitted to OAL in 2007 and will be
- 10 effective early spring.
- 11 --000--
- 12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: In July 2006, the
- 13 Board concurred with the first California reactor landfill
- 14 permit for the Kettleman Hills Landfill in Kings County in
- 15 compliance with the U.S. EPA Subtitle D program that will
- 16 allow permitting of RD&D, Research, Development, and
- 17 Demonstration Permits. The Waste Board and the State
- 18 Water Resources Control Board are working with U.S. EPA to
- 19 establish final approval of California's RD&D permit
- 20 program to allow operations to continue to go forward.
- 21 --000--
- 22 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: In early July of 2006,
- 23 the San Joaquin Valley experienced a number of days of
- 24 extremely high temperatures. I thankfully was in Hawaii
- 25 and didn't noticed. I didn't say that out loud, did I?

12

- 1 These temperatures caused a larger than normal
- 2 number of dairy cattle, poultry, and other animal
- 3 mortalities. The intermittent operation of a key
- 4 rendering plant in the valley created an emergency
- 5 situation in nine counties. Under the coordination of
- 6 Governor's Office of Emergency Services, the Board staff
- 7 delivered guidance to the agricultural community and local
- 8 agencies on the management of animal moralities on farms
- 9 and ranches under a declared emergency. This guidance was
- 10 used by dairymen, ranchers, feedlot operators, or poultry
- 11 farms, and other confined animal facilities, as well as
- 12 local public health, environmental health, emergency
- 13 services, and solid waste management officials to make
- 14 decisions on the best available and safest disposal
- 15 methods.
- 16 --00o--
- 17 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: We also in 2006
- 18 coordinated an outreach program conducted by our Board
- 19 contractors and staff with the infusion of \$5 million in
- 20 additional BCP approved funding refocusing our efforts to
- 21 encourage RAC and civil engineering uses of tires by local
- 22 jurisdictions. It's well underway and continues to make
- 23 progress as we speak.
- --000--
- 25 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: Further in concert

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

- 1 with our colleagues in state government, we are partnering
- 2 with Caltrans and sponsored, "Improving Vegetation
- 3 Establishment and Erosion Control with Compost-Based
- 4 Specifications" workshops in five Caltrans district
- 5 offices during August through October. They were
- 6 well-attended, with a total of 212 staff participating in
- 7 five workshops. The workshops are part of a project
- 8 funded by the Board with a goal of increasing Caltrans'
- 9 procurement of compost and mulch for roadside application.
- 10 The workshops introduced the new Caltrans compost and
- 11 mulch specifications to Caltrans district designers,
- 12 landscape architects, biologists, and stormwater quality
- 13 coordinators.
- 14 --000--
- 15 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: The Board sponsored
- 16 the Emerging Technology Forum in April of this year.
- 17 There were approximately 160 participants, including
- 18 speakers from as far away as New Zealand, Germany, and
- 19 Israel, who spoke about operating facilities throughout
- 20 the world. The keynote speaker was Dr. Helmut Schnurer,
- 21 former head of German Federal Ministry for the
- 22 Environment. Dr. Schnurer talked about the German and
- 23 European waste management philosophy and the shift from
- 24 waste disposal to sustainable resource recovery that
- 25 minimizes landfilling.

- 1 Speaking of emerging technology, later in 2006
- 2 Board Chair Margo Reid-Brown was invited to speak at the
- 3 Global Waste Strategies Summit in December in London.
- 4 Board Chair Brown talked about California's efforts on
- 5 dealing with waste management issues, alternative energy,
- 6 emerging technologies, and greenhouse gas reduction
- 7 efforts. There were representatives from New York City,
- 8 the Netherlands, Sweden, Germany and other countries from
- 9 the UK who spoke about their strategies to increase
- 10 recycling, reduce waste, and produce renewable energy.
- 11 --000--
- 12 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: In 2006, the Board
- 13 continued to work with our sister air and water quality
- 14 regulatory agencies to ensure the safe siting and
- 15 operation of green waste operations throughout the state.
- In 2004, the Board initiated a project in
- 17 partnership with San Diego State University to develop
- 18 solutions to odor complaints plaguing an increasing number
- 19 of facilities. The project, known as the Comprehensive
- 20 Compost Odor Response Project, is a multi-faceted project
- 21 that seeks to provide odor management tools to local
- 22 enforcement agencies and to composting facility operators.
- 23 The project was completed in late 2006. And the summer
- 24 report is undergoing final formatting and review before
- 25 being published on the Board's website later this month.

- 1 Also in concert with San Diego State, we've
- 2 completed bench-scale research and field demonstration
- 3 tests to develop more cost effective affordable ways to
- 4 reduce air emissions through best management practices for
- 5 green waste composting.
- 6 The Board is also working with various Regional
- 7 Water Quality Control Boards on the development of new
- 8 regulatory requirements for composting facilities. The
- 9 Board is engaged in discussions with the Central Valley
- 10 Regional Water Quality Control Board to evaluate the
- 11 impacts and alternatives to land application of food
- 12 residuals from food processing plants.
- 13 --000--
- 14 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: 2006 was a big year
- 15 for electronic waste recycling program. On November 27th,
- 16 the Office of Administrative Law approved our final regs
- 17 governing the covered electronic waste recovery and
- 18 recycling payment system. The program has been operating
- 19 on emergency regs for the first two years. The successful
- 20 adoption of the regs was due in large part to the active
- 21 and supportive involvement of external stakeholders,
- 22 including e-waste collectors and recyclers, electronic
- 23 product manufacturers, local government, nonprofit
- 24 organizations, and state agencies.
- 25 E-waste staff projects payments will be more than

- 1 double for 2006 over 2005 and that the approved electronic
- 2 waste recyclers will receive recovery payments for 64.8
- 3 million pounds of properly collected, processed, and
- 4 documented covered electronic waste. Claims covering
- 5 recycling activities occurring through October of 2006
- 6 totaled \$42 million with 105 million pounds. At the end
- 7 of 2006, starting from nothing at the inception of this
- 8 act, the number of approved collectors is now 508, and the
- 9 number of approved recyclers is 53.
- 10 --000--
- 11 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: The Board's efforts to
- 12 harness the power of state purchasing to effect the
- 13 development of environmentally preferable products
- 14 resulted in steady progress in 2006. The EPP best
- 15 practices manual is online and in use, and over 600 people
- 16 have received training on EPP. Additionally, several new
- 17 environmental standards for computers, monitors, carpet,
- 18 and recycled paint became available.
- 19 The Prison Industry Authority is moving forward
- 20 to manufacture two green cleaning products and will
- 21 continue to make module office systems that conform to the
- 22 state environmental specifications.
- Over the course of 2006, DGS has sought to
- 24 emulate the green building operation that occurs here at
- 25 CAL/EPA and with Board staff assistance has made great

- 1 strides in purchasing 100 percent recycled paper, reducing
- 2 printers, among many other activities.
- 3 --000--
- 4 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: 2006 was a great year
- 5 for the RMDZ Program, as the final two recycling and
- 6 market development zones, Santa Barbara and northeastern
- 7 California, completed the zone renewal process for a new
- 8 ten-year term. There are now a total of 33 zones located
- 9 throughout the state.
- 10 Businesses within these zones divert
- 11 approximately 6.6 million tons and created over 17,000
- 12 jobs. In 2006 alone, the Board approved six loans
- 13 totaling approximately 5.9 million, and these businesses
- 14 are projected to divert over 103,000 tons of material
- 15 annually and create 77 new jobs.
- One significant project approved is the first
- 17 mechanized mixed glass facility which will produce clear
- 18 amber and green furnace-ready feedstock for glass
- 19 container manufacturers.
- 20 --000--
- 21 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: In September 2006, the
- 22 Board started examining the 03-04 biennial reviews, and we
- 23 are happy to report that 270 jurisdiction biennial reviews
- 24 have been approved with good diversion programs.
- 25 Two-hundred-forty-five were above 50 percent, and 25 were

- 1 below but were found to have made a good faith effort or
- 2 met a Board-approved reduced diversion requirement.
- 3 In regards to state agencies' diversion rates and
- 4 reviews, all 406 state agencies and facilities submitted
- 5 annual reports for 2005. The Board at its December Board
- 6 meeting found that only 15 agencies and facilities had not
- 7 achieved the 50 percent diversion mandate as required by
- 8 the Public Resources Code. With this finding, CIWMB staff
- 9 was directed to work with the noncompliant agencies to
- 10 identify opportunities to increase overall diversion.
- 11 Through the collaborative efforts of all the reporting
- 12 state agencies and facilities of 2005, a total of over
- 13 860,000 tons of materials or 77 percent of the waste
- 14 generated by state government was, in fact, diverted.
- 15 --000--
- 16 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: The state of
- 17 California and the Waste Board continues to lead the world
- 18 in the collaboration between education and the
- 19 environment. We saw much growth in this great program
- 20 over this last year. We continue to work towards meeting
- 21 the mandates of AB 1548, now referred to as the education
- 22 and the environment initiative. Dr. Jerry Lieberman was
- 23 hired to assist in the development of K through 12 grade
- 24 EEI curriculum. The Office of Education and the
- 25 Environment also contracted with the National Geographic

- 1 Society to provide posters, pictures, maps, and other
- 2 graphics to help illustrate this curriculum.
- 3 During the summer, our Office of Education and
- 4 the Environment held 18 workshops throughout California
- 5 for non-governmental agencies and taught the benefits of
- 6 aligning various curricula with the Board-approved
- 7 environmental principles and concepts. Additionally, our
- 8 office held workshops to train professional curriculum
- 9 writers in drafting units and new lesson plans for K
- 10 through sixth grade. The OE&E staff have met with many
- 11 teachers and principles and superintendents throughout the
- 12 state in an effort to recruit school districts to field
- 13 and pilot test the units once we've completed them in
- 14 2007.
- 15 --000--
- 16 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: And in 2006, the Board
- 17 accelerated its efforts to reach out to our local
- 18 jurisdictions and educate public officials and staff
- 19 regarding the use of benefits of recycled content material
- 20 such as RAC, compost, mulch, tire-derived aggregate, and
- 21 recycled aggregate. Last year, staff visited with over 44
- 22 cities and counties as well as reaching dozens more
- 23 through the League of California Cities annual conference,
- 24 the California State Association of Counties, and RCRC.
- 25 The programs continue through June 2007, but we've already

- 1 seen a great response from local jurisdictions, and we'll
- 2 see much growth in these products.
- 3 --000--
- 4 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: And with that, Madam
- 5 Chair, your staff of this Board look forward to a
- 6 challenging and productive 2007. We felt we had a good
- 7 year in 2006, but we look to surpass that in the upcoming
- 8 year.
- 9 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: That was a lot. We did a
- 10 lot.
- 11 And I will say a lot of that or a big contributor
- 12 to that is our honoree for the next part of our program.
- 13 And, Cheryl, you're hiding back there. I had to find you.
- 14 But a big reason we wanted Mark to go through
- 15 with his report on 2006 was because Cheryl made such a
- 16 significant contribution to what we did and accomplished
- 17 here at the Board that it was only fitting and right that
- 18 she hear one more time all the great work that the Board
- 19 does and how she made a significant contribution.
- 20 So we do have a presentation. Cheryl, why don't
- 21 you come down. At least sit in the front row so we can
- 22 see your reaction.
- 23 And I do want to acknowledge and welcome Senator
- 24 Peace who's joined us. I don't know if you want to -- if
- 25 you'll say anything at the end. Please feel free if you'd

- 1 like to. But I think we have a little video and a
- 2 Resolution.
- 3 (Thereupon a video presentation was made.)
- 4 (Applause)
- 5 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: I don't recall one picture of
- 6 Rick Dunn in there.
- 7 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: It's very at the end.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: The very, very end. You got
- 9 lucky, Rick.
- 10 I know we have a couple of people here who would
- 11 like to speak.
- 12 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: I'll start. You've now made
- 13 me the oldest member of the Board, senior, whatever you
- 14 want to call it.
- 15 Cheryl, I just was so impressed, because I know
- 16 when I first came to the Board, Cheryl said to me, "I'm
- 17 just a soccer mom. I'm just a soccer mom." And I said,
- 18 "Okay. You're just a soccer mom." But when I saw you in
- 19 action and saw how you just took charge as Chair of the
- 20 Special Waste Committee, how hard you worked on issues
- 21 such as the overhauling the tire manifest system, I mean,
- 22 you really put your heart and soul into everything that
- 23 you did, all the issues that you worked on. And I mean,
- 24 talk about somebody who really did their homework. I used
- 25 to tell everybody that. I said I'm so impressed with

- 1 Cheryl, the way you just dug into issues and did your
- 2 homework. And I want to thank you. Because for a soccer
- 3 mom, you've impressed the heck out of me. So you've done
- 4 a great job.
- 5 We will miss you here at the Board. Thank you
- 6 for your service to California, and I know that you're off
- 7 to bigger and better things, whatever they may be. But I
- 8 wish you all the best. Thank you.
- 9 (Applause)
- 10 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Well, you're a true
- 11 recycler now. That's for sure. When I got here, I was so
- 12 confused. And I said, Cheryl -- I sat down with Cheryl.
- 13 I said, "So what do I do? What do I say?" I'm a business
- 14 guy. You know, but she walked me through this and helped
- 15 me. Sat through the committees and said, "No, don't say
- 16 that. Okay, say that." Okay.
- 17 So anyway, I want to thank you for helping me get
- 18 here and be a part of this Board. But I have to tell you
- 19 on the Committees and the questions and the things you
- 20 asked and the detail about this and that and knowing, you
- 21 educated me. And I've been in the recycling business for
- 22 35 years. So I am going to miss you, big time. And I
- 23 told you that before, and I wish you the best. I really
- 24 do. Thanks.
- 25 (Applause)

- 1 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Cheryl, I think that
- 2 Gary and Rosalie actually captured it very nicely. I
- 3 mean, I'm going to miss you very much. I really enjoyed
- 4 working with you. You're an independent mind and an
- 5 independent spirit on the Board. You may not have arrived
- 6 with a lot of experience, but I think you demonstrated
- 7 time and again what you cared about and what you thought
- 8 was right. And you fought for that. And you stood your
- 9 ground. And you showed a tremendous amount of passion for
- 10 these issues. And I don't know that you can ask for
- 11 anything more than that of a Board member. So I think you
- 12 can leave knowing that you fought the good fight. You did
- 13 great work. You were a tremendous contribution to
- 14 everything that the Board accomplished. And Godspeed,
- 15 good luck, and we love you.
- 16 (Applause)
- 17 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Cheryl, I'd just like to
- 18 say you've left some very big shoes for me to fill. And I
- 19 really appreciate the contribution you've made.
- This program and this law is very, very close to
- 21 my heart, and I've continued while I've not been here to
- 22 watch closely what's been going on over here. And I know
- 23 you've made a huge contribution. And as Board Member
- 24 Danzinger just said, you have spoken your own mind and
- 25 walked a path that has helped to keep things from settling

- 1 into any kind of a complacent or maintenance place, but
- 2 rather tried to keep the program and the Board moving
- 3 forward. And for that I thank you very much.
- 4 And having just left my other job, I think I can
- 5 say on behalf of the State Senate you served your
- 6 appointing authority and the people of the state very,
- 7 very well. Thank you.
- 8 (Applause)
- 9 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Couple of things. Cheryl was
- 10 one of the first people to welcome me to the Board, and I
- 11 appreciate that.
- 12 I'll never forget the picture of you, Cheryl,
- 13 driving the backhoe at the Tracy tire cleanup. Probably
- 14 need a copy of that to remind me of you.
- 15 You're smart. You're tenacious. And you're a
- 16 strong advocate for the environment. And I think we all
- 17 recognize that. And you will truly be missed here. I
- 18 don't think we'll ever look at a RAC contract without
- 19 thinking of you. And we are meeting with the City of Los
- 20 Angeles. So thanks to your strong advocacy, we've got in
- 21 the door. So appreciate that.
- I know we have a couple of people that have
- 23 expressed interest in the audience to speak. And then
- 24 after that, we'll do our Resolution. So former Board
- 25 Member Paparian.

- 1 MR. PAPARIAN: Thank you, Madam Chair and
- 2 members.
- 3 I was here when Cheryl first came to the Board.
- 4 And I think I can say that you brought a fresh and
- 5 important perspective to the Board. You were caring about
- 6 the issues. And you cared deeply about the staff and how
- 7 they were doing and how they were reacting to what the
- 8 Board was up to.
- 9 I remember some very unfair media attacks on your
- 10 appointment to the Board. And I just wish that those
- 11 folks who launched those attacks could have seen you day
- 12 in and day out serving with the type of dedication that's
- 13 already been spoken about.
- I know as a Board member there were some
- 15 issues -- and I know the rest of the Board members at the
- 16 time there were some issues we didn't want to deal with
- 17 very much. And Cheryl would just latch onto those. And I
- 18 think the tire manifest is a really good example of that.
- 19 Complicated, you know, a lot of different players, very
- 20 challenging to address. And you dove in and you dealt
- 21 with it. And I know we were all appreciative of that and
- 22 a lot of the other issues that you worked on. You fought
- 23 for recycling. You fought to make sure we met the
- 24 mandates. And I think I can sum it up by saying you
- 25 served with a thick skin, a soft heart, and a dedication

1 to solving problems. So welcome to the ranks of former

- 2 Board members.
- 3 (Applause)
- 4 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Terry Leveille.
- 5 MR. LEVEILLE: Cheryl, as they say, you came as a
- 6 soccer mom. And for some reason after a couple of months
- 7 you became involved with this arcane waste stream known as
- 8 tires. And really, for the people that I represent, the
- 9 tire dealers, the crusty old tire dealers who said, "Who
- 10 is this woman, " to the tire processors, the guys that make
- 11 the crumb rubber and the tire-derived aggregate and, yes,
- 12 even the tire-derived fuel to the tire-derived product
- 13 manufacturers, you became the tire groupie. And we really
- 14 appreciate your effort on our behalf on so many people
- 15 that really depended on you as the expert on the Board.
- And more importantly, I think with your interest
- 17 and your outspokenness, you conveyed that skill and that
- 18 expertise to the other Board members. And I know that
- 19 this present Board takes the Tire Program very seriously
- 20 and is very adept and very knowledgeable and so much in
- 21 thanks to you. I told Ed Cohn, who's the executive
- 22 director of the Southern California Tire District, that
- 23 you were leaving, and he said, "She's the best thing
- 24 that's happened to the Board since the invention of the
- 25 tweel."

- 1 So once again, on behalf of all of us, in
- 2 particularly me, you've been really a light for this, as I
- 3 say, arcane waste stream. And we really appreciate it.
- 4 Thank you very much.
- 5 (Applause)
- 6 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Terry.
- 7 That's all I'm aware of. But we have some
- 8 last-minute people. In addition to Mark, if you want to
- 9 speak, please just raise your hand quickly when he's done.
- 10 MR. MURRAY: Madam Chair, Board members, thank
- 11 you for the courtesy.
- 12 Cheryl, it has been an absolute pleasure to work
- 13 with you. You came to this Board, as it's been stated, as
- 14 a soccer mom. You were never intimidated by the process.
- 15 You were never intimidated by these people. And you were
- 16 articulate in communicating I think the bottom line of,
- 17 what are we doing to move recycling? What are we doing
- 18 for the public? What are we doing to advance this issue,
- 19 in a way that I think was refreshing and one that I think
- 20 kind of cut through the bureaucracy very often.
- 21 Your courage; you were not afraid. You were not
- 22 intimidated by this process. You weren't afraid to stand
- 23 up for the issues that you cared about. And I think I
- 24 feel that the fact that the process decided to oust you
- 25 from your role on the Special Waste Committee I think is

- 1 frankly a badge of honor that you should wear. And I
- 2 frankly feel sorry for Steve, because I think that, you
- 3 know, she's going to need an outlet. And I hopeful you
- 4 will find that, and hopefully it will continue to be in
- 5 the solid waste and recycling area, because you have been
- 6 a tremendous asset to it. We've appreciated your time,
- 7 and we look forward to working with you in some capacity
- 8 in the future. Thanks.
- 9 (Applause)
- 10 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Okay. Now we have a little
- 11 Resolution. So if you want to come up for that, and we'll
- 12 all gather for a photo over here.
- 13 I'm going to read it over here, because the light
- 14 is better.
- 15 "California Integrated Waste Management Board
- 16 Resolution for Cheryl Peace.
- 17 "Whereas, the California Integrated Waste
- 18 Management Board was established to oversee
- implementation of the nation's most aggressive
- 20 waste diversion mandates while leading the effort
- 21 to create a sustainable economy driven by markets
- for new products made from recycled materials
- resulting in a safer, healthy environment.
- "Whereas, Ms. Peace was appointed to
- 25 represent the public's interest as a full-time

- 1 member of the California Integrated Waste
- 2 Management Board by Senate Pro Tem Don Perata on
- 3 January 8th, 2003.
- 4 "Whereas, Ms. Peace brought her years of
- 5 experience" -- is that right?
- 6 BOARD MEMBER PEACE: No, that's not right.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Senator Perata wasn't her
- 8 appointing Pro Tem.
- 9 BOARD MEMBER PEACE: Senator Burton.
- 10 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: "Whereas, Ms. Peace
- 11 brought to the Board big ideas and strong
- 12 leadership while chairing the Special Waste
- 13 Committee and serving as a member of the
- 14 Permitting and Enforcement and Sustainability and
- 15 Market Development Committee.
- 16 "Whereas, she has raised awareness on a
- variety of subjects and issues, some of which
- 18 were unknown even to the Board staff.
- 19 "Whereas, Ms. Peace provided endless support
- 20 for the Board staff and its programs, including
- 21 those developing markets for rubberized asphalt
- 22 concrete, those exploring and implementing new
- technologies, and those recognizing outstanding
- 24 achievement by small businesses.
- 25 "Whereas, Ms. Peace has left the Legislature

30 still recovering from the four years of waste 1

2 tire education and rubberized asphalt concrete

allocations and tire hauler manifests and 3

4 considering adding a pit full of snakes to their

Committee room to make it more attractive for

6 her."

5

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

7 Inside joke.

"Whereas, the Board sympathizes with 8 Ms. Peace's three sons as they will most 9 certainly undertake the chauffeur duties that she 10 has grown accustomed to from her advisor. The 11 black hat will be bequeathed accordingly.

> "Whereas, Ms. Peace will be leaving the enchanting and glamorous world of waste management to lend her excitement and dedication to other worldly issues of significant proportion where the Board wishes those with whom she comes into contact with a bit of advice: Five-foot-one can still pack a heck of a lot of wallop.

"Now, therefore be it resolved," -- I know, every inch counts when we're this short.

"Now, therefore be it resolved, that the California Integrated Waste Management Board and its staff take great pride in recognizing Cheryl Peace for her dedicated service to the people of

31

the state of California and for her continued 1 2 contributions as a steward of the environment, life-long protector of the public health and 3 4 safety, and environmental justice. 5 "Be it further resolved, that the Board and 6 its staff wish her continued success and will 7 always be deeply grateful for the role she played during her accomplished tenure on the Board and 8 for the friendships that will last forever." 9 (Applause) 10 BOARD MEMBER PEACE: Thank you so much for all 11 the kind words. It's going to make me cry now. 12 I really hate saying goodbye. Seems like I just 13 got here. I mean, this building has been like my second 14 home for the last four years. And I care about the work 15 that we do here, and I care about all of you. 16 17 Now, you thought this was going to be a short

18 Board meeting because I'm not up here on the dais to ask

19 all those questions. But I hope you bear with me one last

20 time, because I do need to say just a couple things.

21 I did need to thank Senator Burton actually who

22 gave me the opportunity to serve, and also to thank my

23 husband who had confidence in me. My husband, Steve,

24 who's here, who had confidence in me and who listened to

25 me talk about nothing but Board business for the last four

- 1 years.
- 2 And also I can't leave without thanking my staff.
- 3 Selma, she was a godsend from the very first day I came to
- 4 the Board. She organized my entire office, and she kept
- 5 Rick and Bendan and I on track and under control. And
- 6 that was no easy task. She is a friend and a confidant,
- 7 and I was lucky she was my EA. And the Board is lucky to
- 8 be able to call her out of retirement for her to come and
- 9 fill in whenever they're in a pinch.
- 10 Erona, I don't know where she is, but thank you.
- 11 She came in and stepped in to fill some pretty big shoes
- 12 when Selma retired, and she did a beautiful job. Thank
- 13 you so much. I'm lucky also to call her my friend.
- 14 And Bendon, who taught me all the acronyms and
- 15 how to understand the agenda items, because heaven knows
- 16 Rick never read them.
- 17 And then, of course, there's Rick. What can I
- 18 say? He was my right hand man -- I guess he'd want me to
- 19 say my left hand man for the past four years. He gave me
- 20 good advice most of the time, even though there were
- 21 several times I just wanted to wring his neck. But really
- 22 the scary thing to confess is from the beginning we
- 23 thought so much alike, almost to the point that we could
- 24 finish each other's sentences, even though I didn't use as
- 25 many "f" words as he did. I really admire his knowledge

- 1 of the legislative process, his involvement and passion
- 2 for AB 939, his passion for wanting to protect the
- 3 environment, his passion for the mission of this Board,
- 4 and for always wanting to make this Board the best it can
- 5 be. I will miss his daily phone calls. And you all might
- 6 not know it yet, but I think you're all going to miss him
- 7 around here also.
- 8 So as a private citizen, I want to thank all of
- 9 you for the important work that you do. Your
- 10 professionalism in dealing with six different revolving
- 11 door Board members all with our own ideas of how things
- 12 should be done just astounds me. You all are just
- 13 incredible.
- 14 And as Mark had mentioned earlier, there's just
- 15 been so many accomplishments this Board has made. And we
- 16 should all be very proud of all of them. But there's
- 17 still a lot of important work to do. But I leave the
- 18 Board in very capable hands.
- 19 But it's now time for me to move on. Time for me
- 20 to start a new chapter in the life of Cheryl, but I want
- 21 you all to keep up the good work. You have certainly made
- 22 a difference in my life. And even though they might not
- 23 realize it, you make a difference in the life of every
- 24 Californian by the work that you do every day. It has
- 25 truly been a pleasure and a privilege to work with you.

- 1 Goodbye.
- 2 (Applause)
- 3 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: We're going to take a couple
- 4 photos. But as is a tradition with this Board, we'd like
- 5 to invite all of you for cake. We've got a cake for
- 6 Cheryl and a cake for Senator Chesbro. So we will meet
- 7 you in the outer lobby. We're just going to do a couple
- 8 quick photos, and then we will reconvene after we've
- 9 exhausted both cakes.
- 10 (Thereupon a recess was taken.)
- 11 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Wow. The audience got a lot
- 12 smaller. Clearly people were here for cake and not for
- 13 the agenda. We won't take it personally.
- 14 Actually, now that you mentioned sugar, seeing
- 15 that the time is 20 minutes of twelve and everybody has
- 16 been sugared up, you have enough energy to plow through
- 17 until we can get through the agenda without breaking for
- 18 lunch. I hope you don't mind.
- 19 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 20 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Here.
- 22 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Here.
- 24 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- 25 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Here.

1 EVECTORING ACCIONANT CARNED: Debencer

- 1 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- 2 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Here.
- 3 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 4 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Here.
- 5 Does anybody have any ex partes to report?
- 6 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Madam Chair, let's see. I
- 7 spoke with Laura Jean Kasa of Save our Shores with regards
- 8 to the education contract that's on the agenda today --
- 9 I'm sorry -- with regards to the Used Oil Program, as well
- 10 as Fred Kelley representing Save our Shores with regards
- 11 to the used oil item. I spoke with Leslie Mintz of Heal
- 12 the Bay with regards to the education item on the agenda.
- 13 I spoke with Terry Leveille I think about tweels. I'm not
- 14 sure what that was, tweels. Okay. So it's not tweedledee
- 15 and tweedledum. And actually we spoke about various
- 16 aspects of the tire recycling and conversion and reuse.
- 17 And then George Larson and I had a conversation about
- 18 plastic recycling. Thank you.
- 19 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: I mean, I was standing
- 20 close enough to be both frightened and have to ex parte
- 21 the conversation with Terry Leveille.
- 22 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: You're just trying to have
- 23 him remind you what tweels are. I know what tweels are.
- 24 But I didn't get the fortunate opportunity to talk to
- 25 Terry. I had a conversation with George Eowan regarding

- 1 some emerging technology issues. Okay. Now --
- 2 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Excuse me, Madam Chair.
- 3 Smithline about Item 18, and Terry Leveille about tires.
- 4 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you. Okay. Now we do
- 5 have a public comment period prior to our going straight
- 6 into the agenda. And we have one speaker who's requested
- 7 to speak during public comment, Evan Edgar.
- 8 MS. EDWARDS: Thank you, Chair and Board members.
- 9 Last week, both George Eowan and I were at an
- 10 RCRC meeting in Davis and missed out on the Committee
- 11 hearing. He has some agenda items on consent I'd like to
- 12 talk about.
- 13 First of all is Item 17, an update on green
- 14 procurement. We highly support that. All that agenda
- 15 item was great. We are impressed with your green roads on
- 16 the home page. So that's a lot of good work there. And
- 17 with Senator Chesbro coming back to the Waste Board, and
- 18 last year he supported the SB 1345, his bill he authored,
- 19 we sponsored it. We want to bring it back this year. And
- 20 with the compost specs out and with the bond money and
- 21 green procurement message, we look forward to making it
- 22 happen this year for you. So it's a great million tons of
- 23 compost by 2010 was our goal. And we're going to look at
- 24 that with the nine compost specs. So we highly support
- 25 green procurement.

- 1 One other thing that Cheryl used to talk about
- 2 every AB 939 enforcement message was putting green
- 3 procurement into everybody's AB 939 plan. And that was
- 4 their common message she was tenacious on. Hopefully, I
- 5 know the Board will pick up on the green procurement for
- 6 every local government to take the compost specs and bring
- 7 it down locally to the local government.
- 8 And Item Number 15 about e-waste, it was good to
- 9 see Michael Paparian here today. He was one of the
- 10 vanguards of e-waste back in the early days of SB 2050.
- 11 And SB 2050 is a great program. It was a great staff
- 12 report. And had I had a chance to comment in Committee, I
- 13 would have talked about the support of the dual system
- 14 with regards to e-waste.
- 15 SB 2050 is a great system whereby people
- 16 voluntarily participate in the program, but there's a dual
- 17 system out there whereby people are not doing all the
- 18 paperwork. They still get ten cents a pound, but they
- 19 still can charge a gate rate at the transfer station. And
- 20 it's another successful program.
- 21 And there's a day of reckoning some day when the
- 22 consumer who wants free and convenient services for
- 23 e-waste who have paid into the system two years ago, year
- 24 ago, the e-waste comes around to the dual system, that
- 25 message may need to be incorporated in some upcoming PR

- 1 campaigns. But that's an update for Mr. Chesbro, because
- 2 I've been talking about that for the last year about the
- 3 e-waste program being a dual program. It's a great
- 4 program, and we support that as well.
- 5 So welcome back. And thank you for my two
- 6 minutes.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Evan.
- 8 Okay. A brief overview of where we go from here.
- 9 The consent agenda is Item 1 revised, 2, 3, 4, 5,
- 10 6 revised, and 8 revised are on the consent agenda.
- 11 Member Petersen would like to make a statement
- 12 regarding one item on the consent agenda.
- 13 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Thank you, Madam Chair.
- 14 It's regarding Item 8. I don't want to pull Item
- 15 8 from the consent agenda, but I'd like to make a couple
- 16 comments for the record.
- 17 This item has been revised subsequent to the
- 18 Committee's discussion clarifying that in the case of both
- 19 grant programs, the Used Oil Nonprofit Grants and the
- 20 Research, Testing, and Demonstration Grants, partnerships
- 21 among municipal entities including the private sector are
- 22 possible, and I'd like to add desirable. I want to thank
- 23 both the Used Oil Program staff and the Legal Office for
- 24 their quick work in clarifying this, because I think it
- 25 opens the door for some projects that could really kick

- 1 oil filter recycling into high gear. Thank you.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Did we want to have the
- 3 specific changes read into the record on this item?
- 4 STAFF COUNSEL BLOCK: My understanding is the
- 5 item has been revised to indicate those changes. So it is
- 6 in that regard in the record.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you.
- 8 Okay. So that is the consent agenda. Does
- 9 anybody wish to pull an item from our consent agenda?
- 10 Okay. Can I have a motion?
- BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Madam Chair, I'd like to move
- 12 approval of the consent agenda.
- 13 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: I'll second that.
- 14 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 15 Mulé and seconded by Member Peterson.
- 16 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 17 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 19 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- 20 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 23 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 25 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?

- 1 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye.
- 2 Consent agenda is approved.
- 3 We will move next to fiscal consent, Items 9, 10,
- 4 11 revised, and 14 are on fiscal consent.
- 5 For purposes of our audience, Items 7, 15, 16,
- 6 and 17 were items that were heard in Committee only.
- 7 Item 13 was pulled from the agenda.
- 8 And following the fiscal consent calendar, we
- 9 will hear Items 12 revised and 18 by the full Board.
- 10 So we will move first to Committee Chair Mulé.
- 11 All of your items were on consent. But do you have a
- 12 Committee report?
- 13 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Very briefly. Thank you,
- 14 Madam Chair.
- 15 We did hear one permit renewal for California
- 16 Asbestos Tire Monofill. And then we heard three
- 17 compliance orders for the City of Baldwin Park, the City
- 18 of Compton, and the City of Gardena. And I'm happy to
- 19 report that they are doing a very good job now of coming
- 20 into compliance with 939. And I believe you were there.
- 21 And we had the mayor from Baldwin Park and the Vice Mayor.
- 22 And we had several elected and appointed officials from
- 23 the cities to tell us about everything that they're doing
- 24 to meet 939 compliance. So it was a very, very good and
- 25 positive meeting. That concludes my report. Thank you.

- 1 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: They did step up in a big
- 2 way, took it very seriously, and that was good to see.
- 3 Next, I will give a very brief Committee report
- 4 as Chair of the Strategic Policy Development Committee.
- 5 Two of our items were on consent. The EEI team
- 6 unfortunately just walked out. But very happy to report
- 7 that we have an MOU with Heal the Bay that was just on the
- 8 consent -- oh, Mindy. We have a Heal the Bay MOU. So
- 9 we're very excited about moving forward on EEI.
- 10 The one item that I did want to mention is
- 11 Committee Item C, Agenda Item 7, was the Board governance
- 12 policies. And that was held in a workshop. Those have
- 13 been put over to next month's Committee to fine tune the
- 14 strategic policy directives. We got some comments from
- 15 the public, and we would like to take those into
- 16 consideration. So at the next month's Policy Committee
- 17 meeting, we will be again doing a workshop. But that will
- 18 be for full Board consideration at the following Board
- 19 meeting as well. So we want to make sure that we have an
- 20 opportunity with our new Board members and give the public
- 21 a full opportunity to participate as well as the executive
- 22 staff.
- 23 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Madam Chair, I'm a little
- 24 behind the curve in this process. And I don't want to
- 25 slow it down or in any way prevent the Board from moving

- 1 forward on it. I do have some comments on it. Would it
- 2 be most appropriate for me to give early warning on what
- 3 those are, or would it be most appropriate to wait until
- 4 the Committee has its next workshop?
- 5 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It probably is appropriate to
- 6 do ahead of time. And what we will probably have to do is
- 7 notice a public meeting of the Board prior to the next
- 8 Committee meeting. But what we intended to do was work on
- 9 it in the Board meeting in more of a workshop style. So
- 10 we'll be able to change and revise and add things at the
- 11 next Policy meeting. And then there will be sufficient
- 12 notice on BAWDS to take that under consideration for the
- 13 Board. So we can do it at Committee or we could schedule
- 14 another meeting.
- BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Thank you very much.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Does anybody else have any
- 17 questions on that? Okay. Thank you.
- 18 Next we will move to fiscal consent items before
- 19 the Market Development and Sustainability Committee.
- 20 Committee Chair Petersen, do you have a report?
- 21 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Thank you, Madam Chair.
- We had a long Committee meeting last week. So
- 23 I'm going to make the report short. Most of the items
- 24 were on the consent calendar earlier, heard fiscal
- 25 consent, or Committee items only. One item remains for

- 1 the full Board discussion, the Tire-Derived Products
- 2 Business Assistance Program eligibility. That's all I
- 3 have to say about that.
- 4 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you. Very brief.
- 5 Okay. We will move next to the fiscal consent
- 6 agenda. First item is Item Number 9. And Jim Lee.
- 7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair.
- 8 Good morning, Board members. My name is Jim Lee, Deputy
- 9 Director of the Special Waste Division.
- 10 Board Item 9 is Consideration of the Grant Awards
- 11 for the Tire-Derived Product Grant Program. This grant
- 12 program provides grants to local government entities for
- 13 projects purchasing tire-derived products such as sports
- 14 surfacing, sidewalks, weed abatement covers, mulch, and
- 15 traffic safety products. In an attempt to continue to
- 16 reduce the amount of grant funds per tire diverted in
- 17 these products, this grant program featured a cap on funds
- 18 of either five or seven dollars per tire diverted, down
- 19 from ten dollars in the previous year grant cycle for this
- 20 program. Despite this lowered amount of grant support,
- 21 the program was significantly oversubscribed.
- Staff is proposing the Board award \$2,369,368 to
- 23 43 identified grant applicants in List A of the
- 24 Resolution. Staff is also recommending the contingent
- 25 award of \$1,895,000 to 31 applicants in List B subject to

- 1 fund availability and Board determination during next
- 2 month's tire fund reallocation process.
- 3 This item was heard by the Market Development and

- 4 Sustainability Committee and recommended for fiscal
- 5 consent. Staff recommends the Board approve Resolution
- 6 2007-09.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Mr. Lee.
- 8 Any questions?
- 9 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: May I ask, Madam Chair? I
- 10 got some staff feedback about this earlier. But I want to
- 11 make sure I'm clear that all of the projects on both lists
- 12 meet the Board's criteria, but some were scheduled for
- 13 funding this month, and some will be funded as a follow
- 14 up. Is that what I understand?
- 15 DEPUTY DIRECTOR LEE: That is correct. Let me
- 16 explain, Mr. Chesbro, if I may. All of the projects on
- 17 both lists meet the Board-established criteria. However,
- 18 we used what we call the random selection process to
- 19 identify the projects and basically determine their
- 20 funding order. So by the luck of the draw, the projects
- 21 in List A were recommended for the maximum amount of funds
- 22 allocated for this grant program as set forth in the
- 23 Five-Year Plan. If it is the Board's desire, in February,
- 24 there is an additional list, List B, applicants which the
- 25 Board could choose to fund, assuming there are funds

- 1 available and there aren't other competing priorities that
- 2 the Board places a higher value on.
- 3 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Do we need to make any
- 4 decision today to make that happen, or will that happen
- 5 automatically?
- 6 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Well, List B will be under
- 7 consideration when we go back and look at the available
- 8 tire funds for reallocation. And last year, this program
- 9 was oversubscribed again, similarly to this one with
- 10 almost double what we had allocated originally. So we did
- 11 fully fund all of the projects last year during
- 12 reallocation. But we don't have the funds this month to
- 13 fund List B at this point.
- 14 We did ratchet down, as Jim mentioned, the fee
- 15 per tire to try to, you know, stimulate the market and
- 16 continue to see how stable this was and test and see a
- 17 little bit how it would work. But we're going to be
- 18 oversubscribed again, because we were so oversubscribed
- 19 last year. And it's still oversubscribed even at the new
- 20 breakdown of per tire fee. And I think not too long ago,
- 21 probably when you're here, they started at \$25 per tire or
- 22 more. And we're down to five. So it's still a very
- 23 popular program. And you know, we'll look at List B in
- 24 next March or April.
- DEPUTY DIRECTOR LEE: February.

- 1 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: February. Okay. Perfect.
- 2 Anybody have any other questions? Okay. Can I
- 3 have a motion?
- 4 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Madam Chair, I'll move
- 5 Resolution 2007-09.
- 6 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: I'll second that.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 8 Mulé and seconded by Member Petersen.
- 9 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 10 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 12 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 14 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 16 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- 17 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 18 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 19 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye.
- 20 Next we'll move to Committee Item 10, Mr. Lee.
- 21 DEPUTY DIRECTOR LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair.
- 22 Board Item 10 is Consideration of Contractor for
- 23 the Tire Retread Targeted Outreach Materials and
- 24 Promotional Training Contract. The item implements Board
- 25 direction as received during last May's tire reallocation

- 1 process. The proposed contractor, the Tire Retread
- 2 Information Bureau, will provide promotional materials and
- 3 training to city, county, and state agency fleet managers
- 4 and staff regarding the purchase and proper maintenance of
- 5 retreaded tires on public sector commercial fleets.
- 6 This item was heard by the Market Development and
- 7 Sustainability Committee and recommended for fiscal
- 8 consent. Staff recommends the Board approve the Tire
- 9 Retread Information Bureau as contractor and award of a
- 10 contract not to exceed \$75,000 for a specified work in the
- 11 previously approved scope of work and approve Resolution
- 12 2007-10.
- 13 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Jim.
- 14 Any questions? Can I get a motion?
- 15 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Madam Chair, I'll move
- 16 Resolution 2007-10.
- 17 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Second.
- 18 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 19 Mulé and seconded by Member Danzinger.
- 20 Kristen, can you call the roll, please?
- 21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 23 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 25 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?

- 1 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 2 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- 3 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 4 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 5 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye. Thank you.
- 6 Now we will move to Board item 11, and Jim Lee.
- 7 You have all the money in your Committee.
- 8 DEPUTY DIRECTOR LEE: It seems that way, Madam
- 9 Chair, for the time being.
- 10 Board Item 11 is Consideration of Grant Awards
- 11 for the Targeted Rubberized Asphalt Concrete Incentive
- 12 Grant Program. This item proposes the award of grants to
- 13 El Dorado County for the amount of \$200,000, to the city
- 14 of Santa Maria for \$200,000, and to the city of La Habra
- 15 for \$150,000 for RAC projects in their respective
- 16 jurisdictions. The item has been revised to reflect these
- 17 proposed grant awards. This item was heard by the Market
- 18 Development and Sustainability Committee and recommended
- 19 for fiscal consent. Staff recommends the Board approve
- 20 Resolution 2007-11.
- 21 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Jim.
- 22 Any questions?
- 23 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Madam Chair, I'll move the
- 24 Resolution.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Can I get a second?

49

- 1 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Second.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 3 Chesbro and seconded by Member Mulé.
- 4 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 5 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- 6 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 7 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- 8 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 9 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- 10 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 11 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 13 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 14 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye.
- 15 And Resolution 2007-11 revised passes.
- And next on fiscal consent is Board Item 14. And
- 17 that will be presented by John Smith.
- 18 RECYCLING BUSINESS ASSISTANCE BRANCH MANAGER
- 19 SMITH: Good morning, Chair Brown and Board members.
- 20 Welcome back, Board Member Chesbro.
- 21 Board Item 14 is Consideration of the Recycling
- 22 Market Development Revolving Loan Program Application for
- 23 Grover Landscape Services, Inc.
- 24 This is a consideration of a million-dollar RMDZ
- 25 loan to Grover Landscaping Services for the purchase of

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

- 1 real estate. As a result of this land purchase, new areas
- 2 will be freed up for composting. An additional 50,000
- 3 tons per year of green waste diversion will result from
- 4 this project and bring overall diversion for this project
- 5 to over 300,000 tons per year.
- 6 The Board's Loan Committee on January 4th voted
- 7 unanimously to approve the project with no additional
- 8 conditions added. This project is located within the
- 9 Stanislaus Recycling Market Development Zone in the
- 10 community of Vernalis. The Sustainability and Markets
- 11 Committee met on January 9th and voted to place this on
- 12 fiscal consent. Staff recommends that the Board approve
- 13 Option 1 and adopt Resolution 2007-15 to approve an RMDZ
- 14 loan to Grover Landscape Services, Inc., in the amount of
- 15 \$1 million. Are there any questions?
- 16 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, John. Any
- 17 questions?
- 18 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: I'd just like to say that
- 19 one of the most important areas that we're going to have
- 20 to deal with now and in the future is the organics. These
- 21 guys really know how to run a program and a business and
- 22 how to make that thing -- their whole program has just
- 23 grown and grown and grown. My hat's off to them. It's a
- 24 fantastic program. They should be teaching others in the
- 25 state too. Those guys should give a clinic on this.

- 1 RECYCLING BUSINESS ASSISTANCE BRANCH MANAGER
- 2 SMITH: I'd say that the zone administrator from
- 3 Stanislaus County came here. If there were any questions,
- 4 it's Denny Hoeh. If there's any questions of him, he came
- 5 all the way from Modesto today.
- 6 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Wherever you are, thank you
- 7 for coming all the way from Modesto. Thank you. I think
- 8 a fair number of us have been down to see Mr. Grover's
- 9 operation, and it is great. Plus, he employs a robust
- 10 staff to market and sell his product, which makes him very
- 11 successful.
- 12 Any other questions?
- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: I'd like to move
- 14 Resolution 2007-15, please.
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: I'll second that.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 17 Petersen and seconded by Member Danzinger.
- 18 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 19 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- 20 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 23 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- 24 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 25 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?

- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 2 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 3 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye.
- 4 Great. That exhausts the fiscal consent
- 5 calendar. And we will move next to Board items starting
- 6 with Board Item 12 Revised. That would be Mr. Lee.
- 7 DEPUTY DIRECTOR LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair.
- 8 Board Item 12 is Consideration of Revision of
- 9 Applicant Eligibility and Evaluation Process for the
- 10 Tire-Derived Product Business Assistance Program.
- 11 The Business Assistance Program is the successor
- 12 program to the Tire Commercialization Program. It was
- 13 specifically designed in response to Board direction to
- 14 address perceived problems with that program, to provide
- 15 targeted assistance focusing on business development
- 16 services, to provide for more fiscal oversight and
- 17 scrutiny as part of the application process, to approve
- 18 the cost effectiveness of the program, and to place a
- 19 stronger emphasis on accountability for results.
- 20 This item was discussed at the Market Development
- 21 and Sustainability Committee. There were several
- 22 questions raised by stakeholders and Committee members,
- 23 the response to which have been addressed in a memo to the
- 24 Board which is available to the public at the back of the
- 25 room.

- 1 In response to some of these concerns, the agenda
- 2 item has been revised to remove from consideration all
- 3 proposed revisions except for the inclusion of qualifying
- 4 California Indian Tribes as eligible applicants. The
- 5 revisions as originally proposed were consistent with
- 6 previous Board direction to staff to exercise continuing
- 7 oversight of the program and to recommend amendments as
- 8 necessary. However, none of the changes are critical to
- 9 the program going forward, and staff concurs that
- 10 consideration of these revisions can be held in abeyance
- 11 pending a report to the Board in March by the contractor
- 12 and fuller discussion of the proposed revisions during the
- 13 Five-Year Tire Plan review process.
- 14 Another stakeholder raised concern and requested
- 15 clarification of the Board's intent to proceed with the
- 16 next cycle of the Business Assistance Grant Program
- 17 currently scheduled for the end of the month with or
- 18 without the proposed revisions. Staff believes this
- 19 comment reflects the shared opinion of many stakeholders
- 20 who are appreciative of the technical services and
- 21 assistance being offered by this program and are concerned
- 22 about potential delay.
- To the extent that delay is being contemplated
- 24 for perceived conflict of interest issues, Program and
- 25 Legal staff have opined that the current Board-approved

- 1 Business Assistance Program reasonably addresses these
- 2 issues. Moreover, it is responsive to statutory
- 3 provisions, state contracting regulations, and
- 4 administrative procedures relative to this matter.
- 5 In conclusion, staff recommends that the Board
- 6 affirm its intent for staff to proceed with a NOFA for the
- 7 next cycle of the Business Assistance Program and approve
- 8 Resolution 2007-14.
- 9 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Jim.
- 10 Do we have any questions from Board members?
- 11 Okay. Easy enough. And nobody has asked to speak, so can
- 12 I have a motion?
- 13 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: I'll move Resolution
- 14 2007-14.
- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: I'll second that.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 17 Danzinger and seconded by Member Petersen.
- 18 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 19 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- 20 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 23 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- 24 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 25 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?

- BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 2 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 3 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye.
- 4 Thank you, all.
- 5 And next for consideration is Agenda Item 18,
- 6 presentation by John Smith and Judy Friedman. John.
- 7 (Thereupon an overhead presentation was
- 8 presented as follows.)
- 9 DEPUTY DIRECTOR SMITH: The item is the
- 10 Consideration of the Scope of Work for the Life Cycle
- 11 Assessment of Organic Diversion Alternatives and Economic
- 12 Analysis of Greenhouse Gas Reduction Options.
- Judy Friedman and Brenda Smith from the
- 14 Division's Organic and Research Efficiency Branch and
- 15 important contributors to the Board's climate action
- 16 initiatives will be here to present the item.
- 17 --000--
- 18 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: Good morning, Madam
- 19 Chair, Board members. Welcome back, Senator Chesbro. For
- 20 the record, I'm Judy Friedman, Manager of the Board's
- 21 Organics and Resource Efficiency Branch and the Board's
- 22 point person for climate change issues.
- 23 As John said, this item is Consideration of the
- 24 Scope of Work for the Life Cycle Assessment of Organics,
- 25 Diversion Alternatives, and Economic Analysis of

- 1 Greenhouse Gas Reduction Options.
- 2 I would like to note that the allocation proposal
- 3 for this Scope of Work was approved by the Board in
- 4 September 2006 where the objectives of the study were
- 5 discussed and the Board approved going forward. This item
- 6 will be discussing in greater detail the Scope of Work for
- 7 the study.
- 8 But before we go into the details of the scope, I
- 9 would like to provide a bit of background on climate
- 10 change issues for those of us here today who are listening
- 11 in who are new to the topic or new to the Board's specific
- 12 involvement in the topic. This will be a refresher for
- 13 folks who have been following this since I first started
- 14 reviewing these issues with the Board in 2005.
- 15 --000--
- BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: So let's start where
- 17 the Board became heavily involved in climate change
- 18 issues. And that's with the Governor's Executive Order S
- 19 305 which was issued on June 1st, 2005, and it established
- 20 statewide greenhouse gas emission reduction targets. And
- 21 those are: By 2010, reduce to 2000 emission levels; 2020,
- 22 reduce to 1990 levels; and 2050, reduce to 80 percent
- 23 below levels.
- --000--
- 25 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: The Executive Order

- 1 also established the Climate Action Team which is chaired
- 2 by the Secretary of Cal/EPA and consists of
- 3 representatives of the agencies listed on the slide. Our
- 4 Chair, our Executive Director, and myself are members
- 5 representing the Integrated Waste Management Board. This
- 6 team started meeting in July 2005 and it contributed to
- 7 the targets and recommendations. We generally met monthly
- 8 until this team issued a report to the Governor and
- 9 Legislature dated March 2006, and currently we are meeting
- 10 quarterly. The information in this report also helped
- 11 with the development of AB 32, Nuez, which was passed by
- 12 the Legislature and signed into law by the Governor last
- 13 year.
- 14 --000--
- 15 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: This bill was landmark
- 16 legislation establishing a cap on greenhouse gas emissions
- 17 by 2020. Assembly Bill 32 requires the California Air
- 18 Resources Board to establish a GHG cap for 2020; adopt
- 19 mandatory reporting rules by January 1st, 2009; adopt a
- 20 plan to achieve reductions via regulations, market
- 21 mechanisms, and other actions by January 1st, 2009, and
- 22 adopt regulations to implement the plan by January 1st,
- 23 2011.
- 24 In carrying out the work, the Air Resources Board
- 25 must also convene an Environmental Justice Advisory

- 1 Committee, an Economic Technology Advancement Advisory
- 2 Committee to advise them. They must ensure public notice
- 3 and opportunity for comment for all Air Resource Board
- 4 actions. And prior to posing any mandates or authorizing
- 5 market mechanisms, they must evaluate several factors,
- 6 including, but not limited to: Impacts on California's
- 7 economy, the environment, and public health, the equity
- 8 between regulated entities, electricity reliability,
- 9 conformance with other environmental laws, and ensure that
- 10 rules do not disproportionately impact low-income
- 11 communities. Please note that the work of the Climate
- 12 Action Team will also be continuing and we'll be
- 13 coordinating with the Air Resources Board on all of these
- 14 activities.
- 15 --000--
- 16 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: The Governor also
- 17 issued a second Executive Order on climate change issues,
- 18 Order S 20-6, which continues to acknowledge and charge
- 19 the Climate Action Team with overall coordination and lead
- 20 for climate change strategies for the state. There are
- 21 numerous other provisions in this Executive Order,
- 22 including the State Air Resources Board will work with the
- 23 Secretary for EPA and the Climate Action Team to bring
- 24 both regulatory measures and market-based mechanisms
- 25 forward on a concurrent and expeditious schedule. And the

- 1 Secretary for Cal/EPA, the Climate Action Team, and the
- 2 Air Board will work and coordinate to develop an economic
- 3 analysis of efforts to reduce GHG emissions, including a
- 4 cost effectiveness analysis.
- 5 --000--
- 6 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: So that brings us to
- 7 what our specific role is. As identified in the March
- 8 2006 Climate Action Team report to the Governor and the
- 9 Legislature, the Board has been assigned three strategies
- 10 for climate change projects. And I'm happy to say, and
- 11 Mark said earlier, we have achieved number one. So we are
- 12 concentrating on strategies two and three, namely the zero
- 13 waste high recycling strategy and the landfill methane
- 14 capture strategy. So why are these strategies projected
- 15 to achieve greenhouse gas emission reduction? The answer
- 16 requires review of some of the basic tenants of global
- 17 warming and climate change.
- 18 --00o--
- 19 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: This is a schematic of
- 20 the greenhouse effect. Solar radiation passes through the
- 21 atmosphere, is absorbed by the earth's surface, and
- 22 converted into heat, causing the emission of long wave or
- 23 infrared radiation back to the atmosphere where it
- 24 encounters the greenhouse gasses and is absorbed and
- 25 re-emitted by the GHG molecules. The effect is warming of

- 1 the earth's surface and the troposphere. The surface
- 2 gains more heat, and infrared radiation is emitted again,
- 3 and so on and so on.
- 4 California's greenhouse gas emissions are large
- 5 and growing as a result of population and economic growth
- 6 and other factors. From 1990 to 2004, total gross
- 7 greenhouse gas emissions rose 14.3 percent and will
- 8 continue to grow unless we implement strategies to reduce
- 9 them.
- 10 --000--
- 11 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: So these are the
- 12 greenhouse gasses that we are talking about when we speak
- 13 about GHGs. Sources of these include carbon dioxide. The
- 14 majority of this comes from fossil fuel combustion,
- 15 primarily the transportation sector, in particular,
- 16 gasoline consumption. Carbon dioxide is 84 percent of
- 17 California's total GHG emissions in 2004.
- 18 Methane. Methane accounted for approximately 6
- 19 percent of gross 2004 climate change emissions in
- 20 California. Decomposition of organic material in
- 21 landfills and agricultural processes such as enteric
- 22 fermentation, manure management, and rice cultivation
- 23 account for most of anthropogenic, or manmade, CH4
- 24 emissions in California.
- Nitrous oxide. Nitrous oxide emissions account

- 1 for nearly 7 percent of climate change emissions in
- 2 California in 2004. The primary sources of anthropogenic
- 3 nitrous oxide emissions in California are agricultural
- 4 soil management and fossil fuel combustion in mobile
- 5 sources.
- 6 --00--
- 7 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: So what's the
- 8 relationship to solid waste? Waste is an important source
- 9 of greenhouse gas emissions. Waste activities account for
- 10 approximately three percent of total U.S. greenhouse gas
- 11 emissions. And that's per the U.S. EPA. By recycling,
- 12 waste-related actions result in emission reduction
- 13 benefits or can result in emission reduction benefits that
- 14 are realized across multiple industrial sectors. For
- 15 example, by recycling, we reduce the need to harvest
- 16 virgin material. We simplify manufacturing processes and
- 17 minimize waste delivery to landfills. And I think the
- 18 next slide illustrates that pretty well.
- 19 --00o--
- 20 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: And this is a schematic
- 21 of the link between waste management and greenhouse gas
- 22 emissions. Waste management options either increase or
- 23 decrease greenhouse gases accordingly. And as you can
- 24 see, energy and material used to play a big part in
- 25 greenhouse gas emissions. For example, let's look at

- 1 extraction. Greenhouse gases are emitted during the
- 2 harvesting of trees and the extraction of transport of raw
- 3 materials. Waste prevention and recycling delay the need
- 4 to extract some raw materials, lowering greenhouse gases
- 5 emitted during extraction.
- I wanted to say one thing about this schematic.
- 7 It really doesn't accurately portray the California waste
- 8 scenario. We borrowed this from our friends at U.S. EPA,
- 9 because combustion does not figure prominently in
- 10 California, and California includes composting and the
- 11 potential for other organics technologies which are not
- 12 represented here.
- --000--
- 14 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: So let's review a
- 15 product's life cycle to see where there are opportunities
- 16 for greenhouse gas emission reduction via reduction in
- 17 energy and materials. When you create a product, there
- 18 are many steps where resources and energy are consumed.
- 19 If you recycle that product, you can eliminate the
- 20 extraction step and reduce the pre-manufacturing and
- 21 manufacturing steps and the energy and resource
- 22 expenditures of those steps. And the schematic shows
- 23 that.
- 24 If you reuse the product, you eliminated all
- 25 those steps. And you actually save the most greenhouse

- 1 gases.
- 2 Reuse can be one of the most positive ways to
- 3 reduce greenhouse gas emissions. It means you don't have
- 4 to expend materials and energy to manage for end-of-life
- 5 or even remanufacturing.
- 6 --000--
- 7 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: So taking into account
- 8 the life cycle of these materials, this slide illustrates
- 9 the intrinsic energy value of various recycled materials.
- 10 For example, aluminum manufacturing is one of the most
- 11 energy intensive. So by recycling a ton of aluminum cans,
- 12 you can save nearly 207 million BTUs of energy. Again,
- 13 energy savings translates very well to greenhouse gas
- 14 emissions reductions.
- 15 One thing I should note here, if you look at the
- 16 list of materials here, you will see -- what you won't see
- 17 are most organic materials. That is because current GHG
- 18 inventory reports and environmental calculators do not
- 19 appear to take into consideration a full life cycle
- 20 assessment and the associated beneficial offsets to
- 21 calculate greenhouse gas emissions reductions for organic
- 22 materials. Hence, why we are undertaking the study.
- --000--
- 24 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: And again, to remind us
- 25 of why we are focused on organic materials, this is the

1 organics pie. Of the total amount of materials going to

- 2 landfills, 70 percent of it is carbon-based organic
- 3 materials and 30 percent is combustible organic materials.
- 4 Since we are moving towards zero waste, we naturally are
- 5 focusing on the largest portions of the waste stream for
- 6 diversion opportunities.
- 7 --00--
- 8 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: But we not only need to
- 9 achieve diversion of materials from landfills, we also
- 10 need to achieve GHG emission reductions as required by AB
- 11 32 and the Climate Action Team report. And we are all
- 12 interested in cost effective mechanisms to do so.
- 13 So our approach is to look at optimizing the
- 14 diversion of waste while achieving the maximum GMG
- 15 emission reductions at the lowest cost possible. So in
- 16 this study, we will be looking at the various organic
- 17 materials and processes for managing them, such as
- 18 composting or anaerobic digestion, to see the tradeoffs
- 19 among waste management options, GHG emission reductions,
- 20 and costs.
- 21 This brings us to the Scope of Work that is
- 22 before you today. As you know, this concept allocation
- 23 was approved back in September, but I'm going to turn the
- 24 presentation over to Brenda Smyth who will walk you
- 25 through the details of the scope of work.

65 --000--1 2 MS. SMYTH: Good afternoon, Madam Chair and Board members. I'm Brenda Smyth. I'm with the Organics 3 4 Resource Efficiency Branch. 5 With that foundation in climate change, I'm going to walk you through a few more slides that brings back to 6 7 our agenda item. --000--8 MS. SMYTH: The Scope of Work before you includes 9 two major areas of study: The life cycle assessment and 10 economic analysis. Life cycle assessment and economic 11 12 analysis will quantify which organic management alternatives and recycling options are appropriate for 13 specific regions in the state of California to maximize 14 greenhouse gas emission reductions in the most cost 15 effective manner. Project outcomes will be a California 16 customized greenhouse gas tool that will calculate 17 greenhouse gas emissions, tons of materials diverted from 18 19 the landfill, and cost for the different waste management strategies with considerations of different regional 20 21 parameters. --000--22 23 MS. SMYTH: Again, existing inventories and calculators like U.S. EPA's warm model or their MSW 24

decision support tool do not include a full life cycle

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

- 1 assessment of organic materials that look at the full
- 2 array of beneficial offsets for various solid waste
- 3 management options for organics. For example, composting
- 4 can result in reduced water consumption for the crops and
- 5 landscapes where it is applied. It can save you the
- 6 energy to pump the water, the energy to manufacture and
- 7 apply fertilizer, pesticides, and herbicides. It can also
- 8 result in the storage of carbon and soils, also known as
- 9 carbon sequestration.
- 10 Another example is anaerobic digestion. This can
- 11 result in avoided fossil fuel use and the creation of
- 12 renewable fuels. So we are going to build an LCA model
- 13 that will quantify the greenhouse gas emissions for
- 14 beneficial offsets, that will quantify the diversion of
- 15 organic alternatives, and that will evaluate regional
- 16 waste management characteristics.
- 17 --000--
- 18 MS. SMYTH: In the climate change work that we
- 19 are doing, we are required to understand the cost of
- 20 implementing the strategies, including capital costs,
- 21 operating costs, the cost of saving beneficial offsets,
- 22 and employment impacts.
- 23 The Governor has been very mindful of knowing how
- 24 greenhouse gas emission reduction will impact the economy.
- 25 The Climate Action Team's preliminary macro economic

1 analysis was favorable, but we are required to refine the

- 2 study, including the Board's part in this. We are also
- 3 going to ultimately be looking at cost benefit tradeoffs
- 4 as required by the Governor's Executive Order. Our Scope
- 5 of Work here will help us understand how much greenhouse
- 6 gas reduction and diversion we can achieve at what cost.
- 7 --00--
- 8 MS. SMYTH: The final result of this Scope of
- 9 Work will be putting the pieces together by combining the
- 10 LCA with the economic analysis in a sophisticated
- 11 multi-dimensional model. The model will be a customized
- 12 tool that will help us look at the tradeoffs and optimized
- 13 greenhouse gas reduction, diversion, and cost.
- 14 --000--
- 15 MS. SMYTH: Here are some of the potential uses
- 16 for this customized tool. We are required to refine our
- 17 strategies as we go along, getting more specific and more
- 18 detailed about exactly how much greenhouse gas reduction
- 19 will be achieved at what cost. As we learn more about
- 20 which solid waste management options result in what
- 21 greenhouse gas reductions, it could help the Board develop
- 22 new and further refine its strategic directives. This in
- 23 turn would help us prioritize and refine our program
- 24 activities. Ultimately, this tool could be used to
- 25 conduct regional analyses.

68

- 1 --000--
- 2 MS. SMYTH: The next steps are: Upon the Board's
- 3 approval of Option 1 and adoption of Resolution 2007-7,
- 4 staff will issue an RFP in February. Staff will evaluate
- 5 proposals in April and bring the award of contract item to
- 6 the Board in May, thus ensuring encumbering the money in
- 7 this fiscal year.
- 8 This concludes my presentation. Are there any
- 9 questions?
- 10 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, both Brenda and
- 11 Judy. I appreciate that. I'm sure we have questions.
- 12 Senator.
- 13 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: I have some comments and a
- 14 question. They're pretty broad questions and pretty broad
- 15 comments and a broad question not specific to the details
- 16 here.
- 17 First of all, I'm very excited about this. I
- 18 think the focusing on the role that waste management and
- 19 recovery and recycling and reduction can play in helping
- 20 us to address the very, very important issue of greenhouse
- 21 gas and global warming is fantastic and absolutely
- 22 necessary and in keeping with the Governor's Order and the
- 23 AB 32.
- 24 But there's another piece to it, too, for those
- 25 of us who had this long-term commitment to reducing the

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

1 waste stream. And that is that it also can put waste

2 reduction and recycling back on the front page and put the

- 3 public's mind -- because the public has shown a really
- 4 strong interest and concern right now and we hope on an
- 5 ongoing basis around this issue.
- 6 So it occurred to me that for recycling, global
- 7 warming is the new garbage barge. Because those of you
- 8 that remember we had a very fertile period in the late
- 9 '80s and early '90s where the public and the news media
- 10 and politicians were all really engrossed and interested.
- 11 And we made huge progress. And the work we're doing here
- 12 is the result -- that the Board is doing is a direct
- 13 result of that time period. I think we're moving into a
- 14 similar time period, and global warming can be that focus
- 15 for waste recycling.
- There's a paralegal strategic benefit that I
- 17 think can help us elevate the issues that the Board was
- 18 created to address. So I'm very excited about that as
- 19 well. So I'm very supportive of this.
- The question I have, and it may seem a little
- 21 archaic, because I know eight years have passed. But it's
- 22 a generic one that I'm going to bring up -- not in Arcata.
- 23 Archaic. Arcata is a little Archaic. They say Arcata is
- 24 where the '60s meet the seas. So there's a little archaic
- 25 thing in Arcata, too.

- 1 But in the effort to get to 50 percent, which the
- 2 very specific statute focused on, it appears me that the
- 3 question of how we're addressing the hierarchy has dropped
- 4 down the list of criteria. And it's still in the statute,
- 5 and I know our role is complicated in trying to figure out
- 6 how to meet the various statutory requirements. Because
- 7 50 percent was the gold standard, and it's been achieved,
- 8 and that's great. But when I was looking through this and
- 9 it came to the question of, for example, cost
- 10 effectiveness, I said, yeah, cost effectiveness is
- 11 important. But in the statute, we also still have how
- 12 various alternatives meet the hierarchy. So I am not
- 13 bringing it up specific, because this is the place where
- 14 this is the most important point. But I think you will
- 15 hear me in future months ask the question with regards to
- 16 various things we're doing. And my generalized input
- 17 without making a proposal to modify this today is that you
- 18 look to have that also be one of the questions that get
- 19 asked, is how each of the alternatives fits within the
- 20 hierarchy. Thank you.
- 21 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Great. Thank you, Senator.
- Gary.
- 23 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: This is fabulous. This
- 24 is where we got to go. Being from the street side of this
- 25 as we are looking at hierarchy, which Mr. Chesbro talked

- $1\,$ about, my emphasis on this is just as we did when we just
- 2 approved the loan for the Grover Landscaping Services.
- 3 It's a full-on giddyup with the companies that are out
- 4 there that are blazing the trials that are trying to
- 5 create the markets and develop it. And simultaneously
- 6 maybe as this process goes along, we're going to find some
- 7 other market opportunities. And for me just to
- 8 concentrate on getting the stuff out on the street to make
- 9 this happen with the hierarchy in mind, but basically
- 10 developing that market and make it happen.
- 11 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you.
- Jeff.
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Yeah. I just want to
- 14 echo what both of you just said. Dead on. Dead on. You
- 15 know, Judy, I'm pumped up about this. I think this is
- 16 fantastic.
- You know, I just recently completed the process
- 18 of going through confirmation. And that gave me the
- 19 opportunity -- and I'm going to stay positive and use the
- 20 word opportunity -- to talk about what was most important
- 21 to me. And there are a few things that didn't change from
- 22 the first day I came back, and that was priority materials
- 23 and organics being a huge focus for us. But also, you
- 24 know, the good news that after 50 percent, still looking
- 25 at what's going into our landfills, it's still a lot of

- 1 this material that's readily recoverable. It's
- 2 recyclable. It's compostable. It's the kind of material
- 3 that the 939 infrastructure is already designed to divert.
- 4 And so finding ways to break down barriers and do more to
- 5 capture more of that same material and just expanding on
- 6 what we're doing, so that's already something that we
- 7 ought to be doing because we want to go well beyond
- 8 50 percent.
- 9 But now we see, you know, the wisdom in the law
- 10 in 939 and the infrastructure. I don't think greenhouse
- 11 gases is referenced a single time in 939. And yet, we
- 12 find that the effort that it spurred, that it launched,
- 13 has a huge impact on our efforts to reduce the heat
- 14 trapping emissions.
- 15 So I'm excited about this, and I look forward to
- 16 sort of like really formalizing this nexus and furthering
- 17 our efforts to move closer and closer to zero waste. And,
- 18 yes, doing it with the hierarchy. And of course, any time
- 19 you want to talk about the hierarchy and the first part of
- 20 it which has been only the surface has been scratched,
- 21 I'll take that opportunity again to put a plug in for
- 22 producer responsibility, which I hope we'll be able to
- 23 work with some of your colleagues to give us more
- 24 authority to actually address waste prevention, source
- 25 reduction, which we do not have a lot of authority on. So

- 1 thanks, thanks, and good luck.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you.
- 3 Rosalie.
- 4 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Just one quick question,
- 5 thank you, Madam Chair.
- Judy, we've received a letter from Mr. Chuck
- 7 Tobin from Burrtec Waste Industries. And I guess he had a
- 8 question on while this is a great tool that we're
- 9 developing, could we use it -- this isn't his question.
- 10 My question is, could we use that tool and expand it to
- 11 other materials, such as C&D materials, paper, and the
- 12 like?
- 13 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: The customized tool
- 14 that we hope to get will be taking information that we
- 15 have in existing calculators, which includes information
- 16 on some of those materials, and the new information that
- 17 we're going to get in this for organics. So we'll be
- 18 completing our array of -- or more completing our array of
- 19 information on those material types and then the economics
- 20 across all of them. So we should be able to utilize this
- 21 in the future for other analyses. We may have to do a
- 22 little more work in the C&D area as well.
- 23 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Sure. Sure. But I can see
- 24 adapting it and maybe not taking it exactly as it is, but
- 25 adapting it for other materials.

- 1 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: Right. And of course,
- 2 with any study you get into stuff and you find other
- 3 stuff. But our idea is to get something here that's very
- 4 workable that we can use just beyond just this project.
- 5 Thank you.
- 6 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Judy.
- 7 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Just along the lines of
- 8 plugging the current practices that we're already doing, I
- 9 had made a note of this. Correct me if I'm wrong. I was
- 10 thinking back to a Board meeting earlier last year, some
- 11 previous study that you referenced that found referring to
- 12 biogenics, I guess which is the natural decomposition of
- 13 organic materials. And that there was a finding that the
- 14 natural decomposition actually emitted more. There were
- 15 more emissions from that then when you run it through
- 16 traditional composting processes. So that, in essence,
- 17 the processes of composting is actually an emission
- 18 reducer. Am I remembering that correctly?
- 19 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: You are remembering
- 20 that correctly. It was one of our Board-funded studies on
- 21 VOC emissions from composting, and actually pneumonia VOC
- 22 emissions. So that is volatile organic compounds, for
- 23 those that hate acronyms.
- 24 So you are, in fact, correct. Now, those studies
- 25 that we did were not specifically done for greenhouse gas

- 1 emissions. So I need to caveat it. But in general, our
- 2 findings have been that by managing the organic materials,
- 3 managing them well, we actually reduce emissions that over
- 4 biogenic.
- 5 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Maybe that can help us
- 6 reduce some of the nimbyism targeted at composting
- 7 facilities.
- 8 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Madam Chair, one more
- 9 question.
- 10 Judy, on the situation such as what happened and
- 11 what's going on or has happened at AQMD, are we going to
- 12 be able to allay and really get to the science of all this
- 13 with what we're doing so that the market is supported --
- 14 hopefully supported by the compost in what we're doing and
- 15 allay some of the fears that we have from some
- 16 jurisdictions that think this stuff is really bad?
- 17 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: Well, one of the things
- 18 that we're hoping to achieve from this -- and we mentioned
- 19 it earlier -- is those co-benefits from organics
- 20 management, looking at things like the water savings, the
- 21 energy savings, and all those things, the emissions, so
- 22 that we can actually have quantified data, you know, as
- 23 opposed to anecdotal data which we have now. So that's
- 24 really part of the idea behind this.
- 25 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: I hope so. Great. Thank

- 1 you.
- 2 Member Chesbro.
- 3 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: I actually started out by
- 4 saying I was going to ask a question, and then I made a
- 5 speech. So what I wanted to get the staff's response, if
- 6 any -- and you may want to talk to me later about this. I
- 7 don't know whether you were prepared with a response,
- 8 because I didn't give you any warning on the question of
- 9 whether any consideration was given to applying the
- 10 reduction and recycling reuse, basically the hierarchy, in
- 11 developing this project.
- 12 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: I do want to say that
- 13 this project is part -- just part of the strategy of zero
- 14 waste/high recycling. It isn't the full strategy. And
- 15 part of that full strategy includes focusing on source
- 16 reduction activities. So as far as the actual Scope of
- 17 Work for this project, you know, I don't think at this
- 18 point we had an algorithm and vision on looking at the
- 19 hierarchy. But we could.
- 20 But I did want to clarify that this is only part
- 21 of the strategy. And source reduction is waste
- 22 prevention. Source reduction is part of the full zero
- 23 waste/high recycling strategy. I don't know if Brenda
- 24 wants to add to that, or Howard is whispering in my ear.
- 25 And Howard has reminded me -- thank you,

- 1 Howard -- that we will be -- the process for these
- 2 strategies are ongoing, continual revising. We're
- 3 supposed to revise them as we go along, as we learn new
- 4 things, as we refine our focus. So we can always build
- 5 more details into it as we go along.
- 6 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Mark, would you like to add
- 7 to that on what the staff is doing as far as source
- 8 reduction and waste prevention? Because I think the
- 9 agenda item as Judy mentioned, one, but maybe you want to
- 10 contribute to the response for Member Chesbro?
- 11 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LEARY: I think the Board has
- 12 placed a high priority, particularly recently, in
- 13 capturing the strategic directives that the Board wants to
- 14 see more efforts in regards to waste reduction. In fact,
- 15 through budgetary language, the Board, the Legislature has
- 16 asked us to look at manufacturers and producer
- 17 responsibility and provide a report to them for
- 18 alternatives and endorsing that concept. So we continue
- 19 to expand in terms of the hierarchy and the higher levels
- 20 of the hierarchy, our efforts that heretofore have been
- 21 considered less than adequate or less than complete.
- 22 So we're looking to move forward in addition to
- 23 the organics focus of this life cycle analysis and going
- 24 to the whole landfill side of our strategies for climate
- 25 change that are targeted out of the P&E shop with Scott

- 1 Walker and Howard Levenson working together with the
- 2 Energy Commission to fully document the opportunities to
- 3 control landfill gas at landfills throughout the state of
- 4 California and better understand the science behind that
- 5 process. So there's a multitude.
- 6 I'm not sure I touched on what you're looking
- 7 for, Madam Chair. But there are a multitude of efforts
- 8 here at the Board engaged with our normal 939 priorities
- 9 and activities that co-exist and link strongly with the
- 10 whole climate change effort that we're all engaged in and
- 11 supportive of.
- 12 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you. I think that
- 13 somewhat touches on it. I think there's a general
- 14 consensus among the Board members up here that we would
- 15 like to see that discussion as part of the discussion when
- 16 we bring up climate, you know, the source reduction, the
- 17 minimizing waste along with the greenhouse gas capture.
- 18 So I think it's consensus among the Board members we would
- 19 like to have that added.
- 20 We do have a couple of public -- did that get --
- 21 actually I should ask Member Chesbro. Did that kind of
- 22 get --
- 23 BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: That's fine. Thank you.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: We do have two members of the
- 25 public that would like to address Agenda Item 18. And the

- 1 first is Chuck White, Waste Management.
- 2 MR. WHITE: Thank you, Madam Chair, members of
- 3 the Board.
- 4 I can't emphasize how important this whole
- 5 project is. The whole greenhouse gas/global warming issue
- 6 I believe certainly is the most important environmental
- 7 challenge facing California, if not the world. And this
- 8 is really going to be important to get some good data and
- 9 information related to alternative management processes.
- 10 It was interesting, earlier in the morning you
- 11 mentioned about how AB 939, we've kind of reached the
- 12 50 percent goal. And people have wondered for the last
- 13 couple of years what's the new AB 939 going to be? I
- 14 think global warming is going to be the new driver for
- 15 virtually everything we do. Where we are work, how we
- 16 work, where we play, how we manage our solid waste. I
- 17 think you're looking at the new AB 939 is how we respond
- 18 to this global warming challenge we're facing.
- 19 One of the comments was made by Mr. Tobin, my
- 20 friend, about the idea of making sure that this is
- 21 consistent -- even though your focus is on organics,
- 22 making sure it's consistent with all the other life cycle
- 23 analysis that's been done on other inorganic things, such
- 24 as the EPA's municipal waste decision support tool that
- 25 Susan Thornlow has been working on.

- 1 In addition, the California Air Resources Board
- 2 is going to be developing a low carbon fuel standard
- 3 evaluating the life cycle of various types of alternative
- 4 fuels, such as cellulosic ethanol, which I'm glad to see
- 5 is one of the objectives you're going to be looking at.
- 6 But it's important the work you do is consistent with what
- 7 the Air Resources Board does with respect to their
- 8 alternative fuel standards.
- 9 In addition, the California Air Resources Board
- 10 is in the process of developing a response to the
- 11 implementation of the Global Warming Solutions Act. And
- 12 one of the things that is a marketable credit -- and not
- 13 this year, not next year, but somewhere down the road
- 14 people are going to be making decisions based upon the
- 15 marketable credits that you get on reducing greenhouse gas
- 16 emissions. And the work you're doing here do very well
- 17 lay the foundation and framework for the value that's put
- 18 on making alternative waste management divisions and what
- 19 kind of marketable credits might be available in the
- 20 future.
- 21 So again, I can't emphasize how important it is
- 22 for this Board to get it right to be objective, to be
- 23 accurate, and to be clear that you're using the best
- 24 information available. Now in last year in global warming
- 25 in California has been a roller coaster ride. I know it

1 has been for me and a lot of people where a lot of data

2 has come out saying this about that and how much is coming

- 3 from the waste industry or landfills and some it is good
- 4 data, some of it maybe not so good data. I can't
- 5 emphasize the importance of how important it is for the
- 6 Board to get it right on this project to make sure if you
- 7 do a life cycle analysis you use the best information
- 8 that's available to make sure you really are comparing the
- 9 alternative management standards. And it is useful
- 10 information to make the correct decisions on how to reduce
- 11 greenhouse gas emissions from solid waste management
- 12 activities.
- 13 And it's really good to see the Board being on
- 14 active participant. I think there's a lot of data that
- 15 was coming down from above and no one knew what was going
- 16 on. The waste industry was caught by surprise. I think
- 17 the Board was caught by surprise. So I think it's so
- 18 positive to see the Board and the staff is really
- 19 recognizing that you need to be in the leadership position
- 20 when statements are made about greenhouse gas emissions
- 21 and the effects as a result of waste management activities
- 22 and you're basically saying what happens, not having other
- 23 people tell you or making assumptions that you're not
- 24 participating in. So this is so good. And I'm so glad to
- 25 see the Board taking this leadership position.

- 1 My last comment is just I hope that the Board
- 2 through this process and other activities you're involved
- 3 in greenhouse gas in a visible, objective, and open
- 4 process. So stakeholders such as myself, any friends in
- 5 the environmental community, we all can sit at the table
- 6 and take a look at the data that is being used. Is it
- 7 accurate? Is it the best information that's available?
- 8 I'm not sure exactly what is built into this process. But
- 9 to the extent you keep it open and visible and
- 10 participatory that those of us that are outside looking in
- 11 we sure would appreciate that. Thank you very much.
- 12 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you very much for your
- 13 comments. Next speaker is Scott Smithline.
- 14 MR. SMITHLILNE: Madam Chair, I'm Scott Smithline
- 15 with the environmental group Californians Against Waste.
- 16 Nobody told me Christmas was coming two weeks
- 17 late this year. So I'm looking at this discussion. We're
- 18 talking about producer responsibility. We're talking
- 19 about working with AQMD. We're talking about this
- 20 particular study. I think one of the only things I asked
- 21 for that I didn't get so far was getting rid of diversion
- 22 credit for ADC. But maybe we're going to get there too.
- Joking aside, I really --
- 24 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Don't take their laughing
- 25 that we aren't going to consider it or at least have the

- 1 dialogue, Scott. But you know, don't go too far.
- 2 MR. SMITHLINE: I tell you I often feel like CAW
- 3 is a lone voice, but it's like a choir in here today. I'm
- 4 really pleased. So I think this study is a critical study
- 5 for many reasons, all of which have been really been
- 6 discussed here. I just really urge to you to support the
- 7 staff in this study. And I think that this truly is an
- 8 opportunity for the Board to take a leadership role, not
- 9 just for the sake of taking a leadership role here, but I
- 10 think there are truly significant greenhouse gas reduction
- 11 opportunities in the waste management sector. This study
- 12 will give policymakers real tools to help make decisions
- 13 on organics. Organic management has not been the shining
- 14 stars of the state.
- 15 I got a call from some policy makers this week in
- 16 South Carolina asking me, "What are you guys doing right
- 17 in California about organic composting management?" I
- 18 didn't have that long a list for this person. And I said,
- 19 "We are moving in the right direction." This will give us
- 20 the tools we need. As Chuck said, we really need to know
- 21 the answers to these questions to make good policy
- 22 decisions. We may have other reasons that we already know
- 23 of why we want to get organics out of the landfills. But
- 24 there are a ton of -- there's a ton of great information
- 25 that we can get. We need to move forward with it. So we

- 1 are in full support. Thank you very much.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Thank you, Scott.
- 3 We have an ambitious agenda. Do we have any
- 4 other questions for staff, Board members, comments for
- 5 audience? Okay. I think everybody loves the proposal.
- 6 Can I have a motion?
- 7 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Madam Chair, I'll move
- 8 Resolution 2006-7.
- 9 BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Second.
- 10 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: It's been moved by Member
- 11 Mulé, seconded by Member Danzinger.
- 12 Kristen, can you call the roll?
- 13 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Chesbro?
- BOARD MEMBER CHESBRO: Aye.
- 15 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Danzinger?
- BOARD MEMBER DANZINGER: Aye.
- 17 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Mulé?
- 18 BOARD MEMBER MULÉ: Aye.
- 19 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Petersen?
- 20 BOARD MEMBER PETERSEN: Aye.
- 21 EXECUTIVE ASSISTANT GARNER: Brown?
- 22 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Aye.
- 23 And that Resolution passes.
- 24 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: Madam chair, if I may,
- 25 I wanted just a quick epilogue. I'd really like to thank

- 1 you for approving this item. But I'd like to acknowledge
- 2 and thank the team that worked very hard to flush out the
- 3 details of the Scope of Work.
- 4 If I may, indulge me, firstly, I'd like to thank
- 5 Dana Papke, who was the project lead on pulling the scope
- 6 together. Dana just recently left our Board to go work
- 7 for the ARB and of all things on climate change. So we
- 8 trained her well and then she moved on.
- 9 Second, Brenda Smyth, who is really my right-hand
- 10 person on climate change issues and knows what we need to
- 11 achieve from this study.
- 12 Stephen Storelli, who used his expertise and gave
- 13 legs to the economic portion of this scope. Fernando
- 14 Burton, who provided expert input based upon previous life
- 15 cycle analyses that the Board did. And Howard Levenson,
- 16 whose insights in so many areas are a constant source of
- 17 delight, not to mention extremely useful.
- And last, but by no means least, I would like to
- 19 acknowledge Mark Leary and your leadership, Madam Chair,
- 20 and support in pursuing climate change strategies. Thank
- 21 you very much.
- 22 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: Bordered on the Golden Globe
- 23 acceptance speech.
- 24 BRANCH MANAGER FRIEDMAN: I just watched it.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON BROWN: How timely. But thank you,

86

Judy, for acknowledging everybody who's been a part of the 1 development of this Scope of Work as well as all of our 2 tasks involved. And thank you also for capably 3 4 representing the Board on the AB 32 implementation. It 5 certainly is a lot of work and a lot of meetings. And 6 that is in addition to our your duties and 7 responsibilities at the Board. So thank you for doing 8 that. 9 I think that finally exhausts our agenda. Does anybody have any Board comments, closing comments? 10 11 Hearing none, we will adjourn this meeting. Thank you. We have closed session. I didn't announce that. 12 The Board needs to adjourn briefly into closed session to 13 14 take up a couple of minor tire items. (Thereupon the California Integrated Waste 15 Management Board recessed into closed 16 session at 12:45 p.m.) 17 (Thereupon the California Integrated Waste 18 Management Board adjourned at 1:15 p.m.) 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

	87
1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
2	I, TIFFANY C. KRAFT, a Certified Shorthand
3	Reporter of the State of California, and Registered
4	Professional Reporter, do hereby certify:
5	That I am a disinterested person herein; that the
6	foregoing hearing was reported in shorthand by me,
7	Tiffany C. Kraft, a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the
8	State of California, and thereafter transcribed into
9	typewriting.
10	I further certify that I am not of counsel or
11	attorney for any of the parties to said hearing nor in any
12	way interested in the outcome of said hearing.
13	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
14	this 30th day January, 2007.
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	TIFFANY C. KRAFT, CSR, RPR
23	Certified Shorthand Reporter
24	License No. 12277
25	